2:15-cv-05254-AB Document 1 Filed 09/21/15 Page 1 of 12 CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 (Rev. 12/12)

CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filling and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the suppose of initiating the civil docket sheet. CSEE INSTITUTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF the USE FORM.

ourpose of initiating the civil de	ocket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCT	IONS ON NEXT PAGE OF	THIS FOR	M.)					
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS				DEFENDANT	S	- 14	PA	E A	
LISA FUCHS				PENN CR	EDIT CORP	ORATION	5 %	54	
(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff SUFFOLK (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)				County of Residence of First Listed Defendant (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.					
	NDERS, PLLC y Plaza, Ste 500, Garder			Attorneys (If Know	n)				
II. BASIS OF JURISDI		ne Box Only)		TIZENSHIP OF	PRINCIPA	L PARTIES			
O 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	Federal Question (U.S. Government)	Not a Party)		n of This State	PTF DEF	Incorporated or Pr of Business In T	incipal Place	tax for Defenda PTF O 4	ora) DEF O 4
O 2 U.S. Government Defendant	O 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenshi)	p of Parties in Item III)	Citize	n of Another State	O 2 O 2	Incorporated and I of Business In A		O 5	O 5
N. NATHDE OF CHIT				n or Subject of a reign Country	O 3 O 3	Foreign Nation		0 6	0 6
IV. NATURE OF SUIT		(by) ORTS	FO	RFEITURE/PENALTY	RAN	KRUPTCY	OTHER	STATISTI	S
0 110 Insurance 0 120 Marine 0 120 Marine 0 130 Miller Act 0 140 Negotiable Instrument 0 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment 0 151 Medicare Act 0 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) 0 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits 0 160 Stockholders' Suits 0 190 Other Contract 0 195 Contract Product Liability 0 196 Franchise REAL PROPERTY 0 210 Land Condemnation 0 220 Foreclosure 0 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment 0 240 Torts to Land 0 245 Tort Product Liability 0 290 All Other Real Property	PERSONAL INJURY O 310 Airplane O 315 Airplane Product Liability O 320 Assault, Libel & Slander O 330 Federal Employers' Liability O 340 Marine O 345 Marine Product Liability O 350 Motor Vehicle Product Liability O 360 Other Personal Injury Medical Malpractice CIVIENIGHTS O 440 Other Civil Rights O 441 Voting O 442 Employment O 443 Housing/ Accommodations O 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment O 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other O 448 Education	PERSONAL INJU O 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability O 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury - Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability PERSONAL PROPEJ O 370 Other Fraud O 371 Truth in Lending O 380 Other Personal Property Damage Product Liability PRISONER PETITION Habeas Corpus: O 463 Alien Detainee O 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence O 530 General O 535 Death Penalty Other: O 540 Mandamus & Othe O 550 Civil Rights O 555 Prison Condition O 560 Civil Detainee Conditions of Confinement	O 690 RTY O 710 O 720 O 740 O 751 O 790 O 791	Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 Other LABOR Fair Labor Standards Act Labor/Management Relations Railway Labor Act Family and Medical Leave Act Other Labor Litigation Employee Retirement Income Security Act IMMIGRATION Naturalization Application 465 Other Immigration tions	O 423 With 28 US PROPE O 820 Copy O 830 Pater O 840 Trade SOCIA O 861 HIA O 862 Black O 863 DIW O 864 SSID O 865 RSI (FEDER O 870 Taxes or D O 871 IRS— 26 U	RTY RIGHTS rights at emark LSECURITY (1395ff) a Lung (923) C/DIWW (405(g)) Title XVI 405(g)) AL TAX SUITS a (U.S. Plaintiff efendant)	0 460 Deport 470 Rackete Corrup 480 Consul 5 490 Cable/5 0 850 Securiti Exchail 0 890 Other S 0 891 Agricu 0 893 Enviror 0 895 Freedor Act 0 896 Arbitra 0 899 Admini Act/Re	teapportions st and Banking erce tation eer Influence to Organizati mer Credit Sat TV ies/Commod nge statutory Ac ltural Acts nmental Mai m of Inform strative Proc ey Decision utionality of	ed and ions dities/ ctions tters aution cedure
	oved from O 3 Ren	nanded from (Appellate Court	O 4 Reinst Reop		her District	O 6 Multidistrict Litigation		***************************************	
	Cite the U.S. Civil Sta	tute under which you a	re filing (D	o not cite jurisdictional	statutes unless d	liversity): 15 USC	§1692		
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO	N Brief description of cau	se: Fair Debt C	Collection	n Practices Act Vi	iolation				
II. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:	O CHECK IF THIS IS UNDER RULE 23		DE	MAND \$1000.00	JU	CHECK YES onl	y if demanded in Yes C	, ,	it:
VIII. RELATED CASE IF ANY (See instru	• •	DGE			DOC	KET NUMBER			
ATE September 14, 2015		SIGNATURE OF AT	TORNEYO			-1			
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY RECEIPT # AM	OUNT	APPLYING IFP	,	SE JUDGE	P 2 1 2	115 mag. jui	OGF		
AM		WILLIMOILL		JODGE		IVIAG. JUI			

Case 2:15-cv-05254-AB Document 1 Filed 09/21/15 Page 2 of 52 5 4

NSYLVANIA — DESIGNATION FORM to be used by counsel to indicate the category of the case for the purpose of FOR THE EASTERN DISTRIC assignment to appropriate calendar. 1 W Elfin Place, MASTIC BEACH, New York 11951 Address of Plaintiff: 916 South 14th Street, HARRISBURG, Pennsylvania 17104 Address of Defendant: Place of Accident, Incident or Transaction: (Use Reverse Side For Additional Space) Does this civil action involve a nongovernmental corporate party with any parent corporation and any publicly held corporation owning 102% or more of its stock? (Attach two copies of the Disclosure Statement Form in accordance with Fed.R.Civ.P. 7.1(a)) Yes \square Does this case involve multidistrict litigation possibilities? RELATED CASE, IF ANY: Case Number: _ Judge Date Terminated: Civil cases are deemed related when yes is answered to any of the following questions: 1. Is this case related to property included in an earlier numbered suit pending or within one year previously terminated action in this court? Does this case involve the same issue of fact or grow out of the same transaction as a prior suit pending or within one year previously terminated action in this court? Yes 🔲 No 🗷 3. Does this case involve the validity or infringement of a patent already in suit or any earlier numbered case pending or within one year previously Yes D No 🗷 terminated action in this court? Is this case a second or successive habeas corpus, social security appeal, or pro se civil rights case filed by the same individual? Yes D No 🗷 CIVIL: (Place ✓ in ONE CATEGORY ONLY) A. Federal Question Cases: B. Diversity Jurisdiction Cases: 1. Insurance Contract and Other Contracts 1. Indemnity Contract, Marine Contract, and All Other Contracts 2. Airplane Personal Injury 2. FELA 3. Assault, Defamation 4. Marine Personal Injury 4. Antitrust 5. Motor Vehicle Personal Injury 5. Patent 6. Other Personal Injury (Please specify) 6. Labor-Management Relations 7. Civil Rights 7. Products Liability 8. Products Liability — Asbestos 8. Habeas Corpus 9. All other Diversity Cases Securities Act(s) Cases Social Security Review Cases (Please specify) All other Federal Question Cases (Please specify) FDCPA 15 U.S.C. 1692 ARBITRATION CERTIFICATION (Check Appropriate Category) Melissa A. Pirillo , counsel of record do hereby certify: Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 53.2, Section 3(c)(2), that to the set of my knowledge and belief, the damages recoverable in this civil action case exceed the sum of \$150,000.00 exclusive of interest and costs; Relief other than monetary damages is sought. DATE: September 14, 2015 314730 Attorney I.D.# NOTE: A trial de novo will be a trial by jury only if there has been compliance with F.R.C.P. 38. I certify that, to my knowledge, the within case is not related to any case now pending or within one year previously terminated action in this court except as noted above.

Attorney-at-Law

DATE: September 14, 2015

314730

Attorney I.D.#

Ca 5-cv-05254-AB Document 1 Filed 09/21/15 Page 3 of 12

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA



CASE MANAGEMENT TRACK DESIGNATION FORM

: CIVIL ACTION

Lisa Fuchs		:		
	v.	: : NO.	15	525 4
Penn Credit Corporation		:		
plaintiff shall complete a Ca of filing the complaint and a reverse side of this form.) It said designation, that defen- serve on the plaintiff and al	I Justice Expense and Delay ase Management Track Designers a copy on all defendant on the event that a defendant dant shall, with its first appeal other parties, a Case Managh that defendant believes the	gnation Form in s. (See § 1:03 loes not agree when the submit gement Track I	n all civil ca of the plan s with the plai to the clerk of Designation 1	ses at the time et forth on the ntiff regarding of court and
SELECT ONE OF THE I	OLLOWING CASE MAN	AGEMENT 7	TRACKS:	
(a) Habeas Corpus – Cases	brought under 28 U.S.C. § 22	241 through §	2255.	()
	requesting review of a decision of a decision of a decision of the security of		retary of He	ealth ()
(c) Arbitration - Cases rec	uired to be designated for a	rbitration und	er Local Civ	vil Rule 53.2. ()
(d) Asbestos – Cases involence exposure to asbestos.	ving claims for personal inju	ry or property	damage fro	m ()
commonly referred to a	Cases that do not fall into traces complex and that need speces side of this form for a deta	ial or intense n	nànagement	
(f) Standard Management -	- Cases that do not fall into a	ny one of the o	ther tracks.	
September 14, 2015			PLAINTIFF	
Date (516) 203-7600	Attorney-at-law (516) 282-7878		Attorney fo	
Telephone	FAX Number]	E-Mail Add	ress

(Civ. 660) 10/02



BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055

Email: ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Our File No.: 109568

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

LISA FUCHS,

Docket No:

15 5254

Plaintiff,

COMPLAINT

vs.

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

PENN CREDIT CORPORATION,

Defendant.

LISA FUCHS (hereinafter referred to as "Plaintiff"), by and through the undersigned counsel, complains, states and alleges against PENN CREDIT CORPORATION (hereinafter referred to as "Defendant"), as follows:

INTRODUCTION

This action seeks to recover for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices 1. Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, et seq., ("FDCPA") and New York General Business Law ("NYGBL") § 349.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- This Court has federal subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 2. and 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d), and jurisdiction over the state law claims pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1367
- 3. This Court has personal jurisdiction over Defendant because Defendant maintains its principal place of business in Pennsylvania.

- 4. Venue is proper under 28 U.S.C. §1391(b) because Defendant resides in this Judicial District and/or because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to this claim occurred in this Judicial District.
- 5. At all relevant times, Defendant conducted business within the State of Pennsylvania.

PARTIES

- 6. Plaintiff is an individual who is a citizen of the State of New York.
- 7. Plaintiff, a "consumer" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3), is allegedly obligated to pay a debt.
- 8. On information and belief, Defendant's principal place of business is located in Harrisburg, Pennsylvania.
- 9. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.
- 10. Defendant is a person who uses an instrumentality of interstate commerce or the mails in a business the principal purpose of which is the collection of debts, or who regularly collects or attempts to collect, directly or indirectly, debts owed or due or asserted to be owed or due another, and is therefore a "debt collector" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

ALLEGATIONS

- 11. Plaintiff's alleged debt was primarily for personal, family or household purposes and is therefore a "debt" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5).
- 12. Sometime after the incurrence of the debt, but before the initiation of this action, Plaintiff is alleged to have fallen behind on payments allegedly owed on the alleged debt.
- 13. At a time known only to Defendant, Plaintiff's alleged debt was assigned or otherwise transferred to Defendant for collection.
- 14. In its efforts to collect the alleged debt, Defendant contacted Plaintiff by written correspondence. ("Exhibit 1.")
- 15. Defendant's written correspondence to Plaintiff is a "communication" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(2).
- 16. As set forth in the following Counts, Defendant's communication violated the FDCPA and NYGBL.

FIRST COUNT Violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692g Validation of Debts

- 17. Plaintiff repeats and realleges the foregoing paragraphs as if fully restated herein.
- 18. 15 U.S.C. § 1692g provides that within five days after the initial communication with a consumer in connection with the collection of any debt, a debt collector shall, unless the information is contained in the initial communication or the consumer has paid the debt, send the consumer a written notice containing certain enumerated information.
- 19. The written notice must contain a statement that unless the consumer, within thirty days after receipt of the notice, disputes the validity of the debt, or any portion thereof, the debt will be assumed to be valid by the debt collector.
- 20. The written notice must contain a statement that if the consumer notifies the debt collector in writing within the thirty-day period that the debt, or any portion thereof, is disputed, the debt collector will obtain verification of the debt or a copy of a judgment against the consumer and a copy of such verification or judgment will be mailed to the consumer by the debt collector.
- 21. The written notice must contain a statement that, upon the consumer's written request within the thirty-day period, the debt collector will provide the consumer with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.
- 22. A debt collector has the obligation, not just to convey the required information, but also to convey such clearly.
- 23. Even if a debt collector conveys the required information accurately, the collector nonetheless violates the FDCPA if that information is overshadowed or contradicted by other language in the communication, or by other collection activities during the 30-day validation period following the communication.
- 24. A collection activity or communication overshadows or contradicts the validation notice if it would make the "least sophisticated consumer" uncertain or confused as to her rights.
- 25. Defendant's letter states that, "Our client has referred the account(s) to us for collection in full" and that, "Our client has exhausted all means of resolving this account."
- 26. The letter further demands that Plaintiff must "Pay in full or contact our office to make payment arrangements."

- 27. At the same time, however, Defendant's letter demands payment not at the "Total Balance Due," but rather at a reduced "Settlement Amount."
- 28. It is unclear whether Defendant is demanding payment in full or payment of a reduced amount.
- 29. Defendant has violated § 1692g as the language of the letter would leave the "least sophisticated consumer," uncertain as to her rights.
- 30. Defendant has violated § 1692g as the language of the letter would leave the "least sophisticated consumer," confused as to her rights.
 - 31. As such, Defendant has violated § 1692g.

SECOND COUNT Violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692g Validation of Debts

- 32. Plaintiff repeats and realleges the foregoing paragraphs as if fully restated herein.
- 33. Demanding immediate payment without explaining that such demand does not override the consumers right to validation is a violation of the FDCPA.
 - 34. Defendant has demanded Plaintiff make payment during the validation period.
- 35. Defendant has demanded Plaintiff make payment during the validation period, without explaining that such demand does not override the Plaintiff's right to demand validation.
- 36. Defendant has violated § 1692g as Defendant overshadowed the information required to be provided by that Section.

THIRD COUNT Violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692g Validation of Debts

- 37. Plaintiff repeats and realleges the foregoing paragraphs as if fully restated herein.
- 38. Here, Defendant's letter states "Pay in full or contact our office to make payment arrangements."
- 39. This demand by Defendant overshadows Plaintiff's right to do neither of those two things, and instead exercise her validation rights.
- 40. Defendant's demand would make the "least sophisticated consumer" confused as to her rights.

- 41. Defendant's demand would make the "least sophisticated consumer" uncertain as to her rights.
 - 42. Defendant has therefore violated § 1692g.

FOURTH COUNT Violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692e False or Misleading Representations

- 43. Plaintiff repeats and realleges the foregoing paragraphs as if fully restated herein.
- 44. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e prohibits a debt collector from using any false, deceptive, or misleading representation or means in connection with the collection of any debt.
- 45. While § 1692e specifically prohibits certain practices, the list is non-exhaustive, and does not preclude a claim of falsity or deception based on non-enumerated practice.
- 46. Collection notices are deceptive if they can be reasonably read to have two or more different meanings, one of which is inaccurate.
- 47. The question of whether a collection letter is deceptive is determined from the perspective of the "least sophisticated consumer."
- 48. Because the collection letter in the instant case was reasonably susceptible to an inaccurate reading, as described above, it is deceptive within the meaning of the FDCPA.
- 49. The "least sophisticated consumer" would likely be deceived by Defendant's conduct.
- 50. Defendant has violated § 1692e by using a false, deceptive and misleading representation in its attempt to collect a debt.

FIFTH COUNT Violation of New York General Business Law §349

- 51. Plaintiff repeats and realleges the foregoing paragraphs as if fully restated herein.
- 52. Defendant owed a duty to Plaintiff to effect its collection of Plaintiff's alleged debt with reasonable care
- 53. Defendant's deception as described herein shows a lack of exercise of reasonable care in Defendant's collection of the alleged debt.
- 54. Defendant breached its duty to collect Plaintiff's alleged debt with reasonable care.

- 55. Defendant's conduct was committed by Defendant in the conduct of a business, trade or commerce or the furnishing of a service in New York State and constitutes a violation of NY GBL § 349(a).
- 56. Defendant's conduct was consumer-orientated in that the letter was sent in an effort to collect an alleged consumer debt.
- 57. Defendant's conduct has a broader impact on consumers at large as, upon information and belief, Defendant has sent the subject form letter to hundreds of consumers.
 - 58. Plaintiff is a reasonable consumer.
 - 59. Defendant's conduct would mislead a reasonable consumer.
 - 60. Defendant engaged in a material deceptive act or practice as described herein.
 - 61. Defendant's conduct caused plaintiff to suffer injury.
- 62. Defendant violated NY GBL § 349(a) and is liable to Plaintiff pursuant to NY GBL § 349(h).

JURY DEMAND

63. Plaintiff hereby demands a trial of this action by jury.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment as follows:

- a. Statutory damages against Defendant pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k of \$1,000.00; and
- b. Plaintiff's attorneys' fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- c. Plaintiff's actual damages; and
- d. Damages against Defendant pursuant to NYGBL § 349; and
- e. Plaintiff's costs; together with
- f. Such other relief that the Court determines is just and proper.

BARSHAY | SANDERS PULC 100 GARDEN CITY PLAZA, SUITE 500 GARDEN CITY, NEW YORK 11530 DATED: September 14, 2015

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

By: Massa A. Pirillo, Esq.

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC 100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500

Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055

ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Our File No.: 109568

EXHIBIT 1

Hours: Mon-Thur 8am-10pm EST

Fri 8am-5pm EST Sat 8am-12pm EST

Phone: 800-900-1370



CLIENT: QVC

ID NUMBER: 5370

TOTAL BALANCE DUE: \$562.03 SETTLEMENT AMOUNT: \$421.00



Our client has referred the account(s) to us for collection in full. Our client has exhausted all means of resolving this account. All payments and inquires should be made directly with our office.

Pay in full or contact our office to make payment arrangements. It is important you communicate with our office if you can not make payment. We can help you. Call our offices for help.

PCC and our client understand you may not be in a position to pay in full due to financial hardship(s). We are willing to discuss settlement in full and/or make payment arrangements of the below referenced account(s). Please be advised, if you choose to take advantage of the settlement offer you will not have any additional purchasing privileges with QVC in the future. Please send your payment or you may pay on line at http://account.penncredit.com or call the phone number provided on this letter to pay by phone with your check or Visa / MasterCard.

Unless you notify this office within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid. If you notify this office in writing within 30 days from receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will obtain verification of the debt or obtain a copy of a judgment and mail you a copy of such judgment or verification. If you request this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice this office will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.

This letter is from a debt collector. This is an attempt to collect a debt and any information obtained will be used for that purpose.

SERVICE RENDERED ORDERED MERCHANDISE 2014/04/16

SERVICE DATE ACCOUNT NUMBER 3937

BALANCE

\$562.03

New York Residents:

Debt collectors, in accordance with the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692 et seq., are prohibited from engaging in abusive, deceptive, and unfair debt collection efforts, including but not limited to: a) the use or threat of violence; b) the use of obscene or profane language; and c) repeated phone calls made with the intent to annoy, abuse, or harass. Penn Credit Corporation's New York City Department of Consumer Affairs license number is 1039314.



DETACH AND RETURN WITH PAYMENT TO EXPEDITE CREDIT TO YOUR ACCOUNT

P.O Box 1259, Department 91047 Oaks, PA 19456 CHANGE SERVICE REQUESTED

IF PAYING B	Y VIBA, MASTERCARD OR DISCOVER.	FILL OUT BELOW
CIVIBA VAC	MARITERCATID CO	DISCOVER COM
CARD HARREST		EXF. DATE
STITLE		AMIXUNT

Visit http://account.penncredit.com to pay your bill online.

Payments received by check will be electronically deposited, unless you pay by non-consumer type check. You may opt out of this program by paying with a money order or a travelers check. In the unlikely event your check (payment) is returned unpaid, we may elect to electronically (or by paper draft) re-present your check (payment) up to two more times. You also understand and agree that we may collect a return processing charge by the same means, in an amount not to exceed that as permitted by state law. ID NUMBER: SETTLEMENT AMOUNT: \$421.00 05/29/15

╶╬╎╌╻╂╍╎╎┞┰┆╼┰╒┆┧┞┰┆┸┸┆┸╏┸┇┦┸╃╏┸╒┦┞╻┩╬┰┆┞┆╏┞┼┞┼┼┞┆┎┸╌╿

91203 - 953

LISA FUCHS 1 W ELFIN PL MASTIC BEACH NY 11951-5508 PENN CREDIT 916 2 14th ST PO BOX 988 HARRISBURG PA 17108-0988 DAP-933-B-0